

Shepard's Editorial Phrases – Alphabetical List

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
130D motion filed by	A party has moved the Texas Supreme Court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) for an extension of time to file an application for a writ of error in the Court of Appeals under Rule 130 (d), Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
53.7(F) mot. for extension of time filed by	A party has filed a motion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) requesting the Texas Supreme Court to extend the time to file a petition for review under Rule 53.7(f), Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
90C motion filed by	A party has moved the Texas Supreme Court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to reconsider whether to publish an opinion under Rule 90(c), Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
ALJ - Initial Determination	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), an Administrative Law Judge has made an initial determination based on an investigation into alleged violations. Generally, such determination will eventually be considered by a judge or agency commission/board.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
ALJ - Recommendation	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), an Administrative Law Judge has made preliminary findings based on an investigation into alleged violations. Generally, such determination will eventually be considered by a judge or agency commission/board.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abated	Used primarily when a party (usually the accused) dies or the subject becomes moot.	No Signal
Abrogated as noted in Concurring Opinion	The citing concurring opinion notes that the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abrogated as stated in	The citing case states that the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an	Questioned - Validity questioned by

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Abrogated as stated in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange) The citing concurring opinion notes that the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	citing references (Orange) Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abrogated as stated in by questionable precedent at	The citing case states that the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abrogated by	The citing case effectively, but not explicitly, overrules or departs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Abrogated by questionable precedent at	The citing case effectively, but not explicitly, overrules or departs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abrogated in part as noted in Concurring Opinion	The citing concurring opinion notes that some part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abrogated in part as stated in	The citing case states that some part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange)	Questioned - Validity questioned by citing references (Orange)
Abrogated in part as stated in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing concurring opinion notes that some part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Abrogated in part as stated in by questionable precedent at	The citing case states that some part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been effectively, but not explicitly, overruled or departed from by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abrogated in part by	The citing case effectively, but not explicitly, overrules or departs from some part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Abrogated in part by questionable precedent at	The citing case effectively, but not explicitly, overrules or departs from some part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Abstained by	A bankruptcy court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has declined to exercise jurisdiction over a bankruptcy proceeding or to decide a particular issue, often to avoid conflict with a proceeding in another court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Accepted by	A court recognizes and accepts the reasoning or holding advanced by the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). Commonly used to signify that a federal district court has accepted the recommendation of a magistrate, or that a National Labor Relations Board panel has accepted an Administrative Law Judge's opinion. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Acquiesced in part, Not Acquiesced in part by	The Commissioner agrees with the legal reasoning of some of the issues or part of the result, of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but disagrees with the legal reasoning of other issues or another aspect of the result of the same case. The IRS will not take an appeal or relitigate the issues with which the Commissioner agrees but may appeal and/or relitigate all other issues. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Acquiescence by Commissioner at	The Commission acquiesces in the reasoning or result of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Acquiescence by Commissioner in part at	The Commissioner agrees with the legal reasoning of some of the issues, and part of the result, of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the IRS. The IRS will not take an appeal or relitigate the issues with which the Commissioner agrees but may appeal and/or relitigate all other issues. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Acquiescence by Commissioner in part withdrawn by	Although the Commissioner had previously agreed with the legal reasoning of some of the issues and part of the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the IRS, that agreement has been reversed. The IRS may take an appeal, or relitigate those issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Acquiescence by Commissioner in result in part by	The Commissioner does not agree with the legal reasoning but does agree with part of the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the government. The IRS may take an appeal, if timely, on those parts of the result not agreed with, and may relitigate any issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Acquiescence by Commissioner in result in part withdrawn by	Although the Commissioner had previously agreed with part of the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the IRS, that agreement is withdrawn. The IRS may take an appeal, if timely, on any parts of the result previously agreed with, and may relitigate any issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Acquiescence by Commissioner in result only at	The Commissioner does not agree with the legal reasoning but does agree with the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the IRS. The IRS may not take an appeal but may relitigate any issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Acquiescence by Commissioner in result withdrawn by	Although the Commissioner had previously agreed with the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the government, that agreement is reversed. The IRS may take an appeal from the decision, if timely, and may relitigate any issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Acquiescence by Commissioner in result withdrawn, in part by	Although the Commissioner had previously in part agreed with the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that is decided against the IRS, a portion of that agreement is reversed. The IRS may take an appeal, if timely, on those parts of the result previously agreed with and may relitigate any issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Acquiescence by Commissioner withdrawn by	Although the Commissioner had previously agreed with the legal reasoning of all issues and the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the IRS, that agreement has been reversed. The IRS may take an appeal or relitigate any issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Acquiescence by Commissioner withdrawn in part by	Although the Commissioner has previously agreed with the legal reasoning of all issues and the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was decided against the IRS, that agreement has been reversed as to some of the issues and part of the result. The IRS may take an appeal or relitigate those issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Added	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, adds new matter to the statute, rule, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Added and renumbered by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through addition and renumbering. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Added and repealed by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through addition and repeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Adhered to	On appeal or rehearing, a Court has reconsidered the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and arrived at the same conclusion, even though additional facts or circumstances were presented and considered. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Adjudicated by	The citing case involves the patent, copyright or trademark you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but there is no holding that calls for a more specific editorial letter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Administrative Proceeding in	The citing decision or order involves the docket or rulemaking number you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Adopted by	The Court has adopted an extrajudicial, administrative, or pretrial decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase most often appears where a Federal District Court judge adopts a Magistrate's decision, or where a National Labor Relations Board panel had adopted an Administrative Law Judge's opinion. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Adversary proceeding at	A separately contested action between a creditor and debtor during the course of the bankruptcy proceeding, which you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), usually involving certain facts or issues in common with the main bankruptcy case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Affirmed by	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case affirms or adheres to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Affirmed by Circuit Court at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been affirmed by the appropriate Ohio Circuit Court. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases that are cited	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	
Affirmed by Court of Appeals at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been affirmed by the appropriate Ohio Court of Appeals. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases that are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Affirmed by Court of Common Pleas at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been affirmed by the appropriate Ohio Court of Common Pleas. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases that are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Affirmed by Supreme Court at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been affirmed by the Ohio Supreme Court. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases that are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Affirmed by questionable precedent at	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case affirms or adheres to the case you SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Affirmed conditionally by	The lower court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has essentially been upheld, dependent upon the satisfaction of some stipulation or qualification imposed by the appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Affirmed in part and appeal dismissed in part by	An appellate court has upheld part of the judgment of the lower court or agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and has discontinued the remainder of the appeal without any further reconsideration. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Affirmed in part and modified in part by	An appellate court has upheld part of the judgment of the lower court or agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) but has also changed part of that judgment. The lower court decision is still good law except to the extent changed by the appellate court. SHEPARD'S	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Affirmed in part and remanded in part by	<p>Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p> <p>An appellate court has upheld part of the judgment of the lower court or agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and has returned the remainder of the judgment to the lower court for further proceedings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Affirmed in part and reversed in part by	<p>An appellate court has upheld part of the judgment of the lower court or agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) but has overturned the remainder of the judgment. That part of the lower court decision being overturned should no longer be considered good law. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Affirmed in part and set aside in part by	<p>An appellate court has upheld part of the judgment of the lower court or agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) but has rejected the remainder of that judgment by specifically using the phrase "set aside." That part of the lower court or agency decision being set aside should no longer be considered good law. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Affirmed in part and superseded in part by	<p>An appellate court has upheld part of the judgment of a lower court or agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but has superseded the remainder of the lower court judgment. That part of the lower court decision being superseded should no longer be considered good law.</p>	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Affirmed in part and vacated in part by	<p>An appellate court has upheld part of the judgment of the lower court or agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but has annulled or canceled the remainder of the judgment. That part of the lower court decision being vacated should no longer be considered good law. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Affirmed in part without op. and remanded in part without op. by	<p>An appellate court, in a table case entry without any discussion or citation of other authority, has affirmed some aspect of the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but on another</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	point has elected to remand the matter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Affirmed in part without op. and reversed in part without op. by	An appellate court, in a table case entry without any discussion or citation of other authority, has affirmed some aspect of the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but on another point has overturned the lower court decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Affirmed in part without opinion and vacated in part without opinion	An appellate court, in a table case entry without any discussion or citation of other authority, has affirmed some aspect of the decisions that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but on another point has vacated the lower court decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Affirmed on other grounds by	While the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been affirmed on appeal, the appellate court disagrees with the legal reasoning used by the court in reaching the decision being affirmed.	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Affirmed without opinion by	An appellate court has upheld the lower court's judgment, decree or order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but without any written opinion discussing its reasons for the affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Allocatur denied by	The citing order denies allocatur in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Allocatur granted by	The citing order grants allocatur in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Altered by	The court has changed or modified some aspect of the decision that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Amended and re-enacted at	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through amendment and reenactment. SHEPARD'S	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Amended and renumbered by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through amendment and renumbering. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Amended and repealed by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through amendment and repeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Amended and repealed in part by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through partial amendment and partial repeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Amended by	For statutes, regulations or administrative rulings, the citing reference amends or alters the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). For case law, a court has changed or improved its own judgment, order or opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) generally by means of additions or deletions, thereby limiting the validity or precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Among conflicting authorities as noted in Depublished Concurring Opini	In a concurring opinion, the citing opinion notes conflicting lines of authority on an issue, without taking a position on which line of authority should be applied, and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. The case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) falls along one of the noted lines of authority. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Among conflicting authorities as noted in concurring opinion	The concurring opinion notes conflicting lines of authority on an issue, without taking a position on which line of authority should be applied. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Among conflicting authorities as noted in questionable precedent at	The citing opinion notes conflicting lines of authority on an issue, without taking a position on which line of authority should be applied. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Among conflicting authorities noted in	The citing opinion notes conflicting lines of authority on an issue, without taking a position on which line of authority should be applied. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Amplified by	The citing decision expands or extends to a different factual situation the statute, revenue ruling or revenue procedure you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Amplified by	The citing reference, typically a record of administrative action, expands or extends to a different factual situation the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Amplified by	The rationale of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is no longer limited to its facts or circumstances, but is generally applicable. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Annulled by	The court has abrogated a prior judgment in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and deprived it of any force or operation. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Answer conformed to	The court has rendered its decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) based upon the answer to a question certified to a different court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal after remand at	This phrase is used when a case cites an earlier appellate level case, and indicates that there has been an intervening, uncited decision on remand to a lower court. The case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) responds to the decision on remand. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal denied by	An appellate court has refused to accept or hear an appeal of the judgment, decree or order of	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	the lower court or administrative agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is still good law, although further appeal is possible if a higher court exists. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal dismissed by	An appellate court has reconsidered and retracted its own prior order granting appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) or has discontinued an appeal without consideration of the judgment, decree, or order of the lower court or administrative agency in the case your SHEPARDIZING(TM). The case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is still good law, although further appeal is possible if a higher court exists. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal dismissed for want of debatable question by	An appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been dismissed since the court has found that no debatable constitutional questions exists. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal dismissed without opinion by	An appellate court has discontinued an appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) without consideration of the lower court's judgment, decree or order and without any written opinion discussing its reasons for the dismissal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal filed	Notice of appeal of a federal district court decision in the action has been filed, and the court of appeals has assigned a case number. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Appeal granted by	An appellate court or court acting in an appellate capacity has agreed to accept or hear an appeal in order to review the judgment, decree, or order of a lower court, tribunal, or administrative agency. Subsequently, the appeal has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal granted by	An appellate court has agreed to accept or hear an appeal in order to review the judgment,	Caution - Possible negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	decreed or order of a lower court or administrative agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). There will likely be a subsequent order or opinion by the court to indicate its disposition of the appeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Appeal reinstated by	An appeal formerly dismissed by an appellate court or a court acting in an appellate capacity has been reinstated, due to the submission of new grounds by the appellant and/or reconsideration by the court. Subsequently, the appeal has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal reinstated by	An appeal formerly dismissed by the court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been taken up again, due to the submission of new grounds by the appellant and/or a reconsideration by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Appeal settled and dismissed by	An appeal that was pending before the court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been resolved, due to an agreement reached by the parties. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal sustained by	The Board of Contract Appeals in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) agrees with the appellant upon review of appellant's claims on appeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Appeal terminated by	An appeal has been terminated. In federal civil cases, this phrase covers situations in which a notice of appeal was filed, but the appeal was later dismissed or certificate of appealability was denied. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Appeal withdrawn by	An appeal that was pending before the court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has ended upon request by the appellant. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Application denied by	A court has declined to grant a request or petition by a party in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and has specifically used the language "application denied." SHEPARD'S	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Application for writ filed	The citing reference notes an application or motion for writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Application for writ of error removed to federal court	An application for a writ of error filed pursuant to Rule 130 in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) includes a constitutional issue, and has been removed to the United States Supreme Court or federal Court of Appeals for resolution. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Application granted by	A court allowed a request or petition by a party to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and has specifically used the language "application granted." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Approved as supplemented by	The court has basically confirmed the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) with an addendum of some nature. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Approved by	A court has confirmed or approved the decision of the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). Encountered in Florida, where the Supreme Court "approves" rather than "affirms" a decision of the District Court of Appeals. This phrase also appears where a Federal District Court judge approves a Magistrate's decision and where a National Labor Relations Board panel has approved an Administrative Law Judge's opinion. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Argued on	Respective counsel have presented their case to the United States Supreme Court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This information is derived from a table in the United States Law Weekly publication. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
As moot	A request, motion, petition, or similar matter, in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), has been denied, dismissed, or otherwise ruled upon, due to its being determined moot. SHEPARD'S	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Automatic stay modified by	A bankruptcy court (or an appellate court sitting in review of a bankruptcy court decision) has changed or amended some aspect of the automatic stay in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). Also used in general context outside the bankruptcy jurisdictions where court language supports its use. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Bid protest denied	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), the agency has denied the challenge to the award or proposed award of a contract for procurement of goods and services or a challenge to the terms of a solicitation for such a contract (bid protest) because there was no merit to the protest.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Bid protest sustained	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), the agency has sustained the challenge to the award or proposed award of a contract for procurement of goods and services or a challenge to the terms of a solicitation for such a contract (bid protest) and agrees with the protest arguments.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
By an equally divided Court at	A phrase used when an appellate court cannot reach a clear consensus and ends up split on an issue, to indicate in accordance with Bluebook rules that the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not upheld by the single, clear holding of a majority of the appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
By unreported decision at	A phrase used in combination with some other history phrase to show that the action taken on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) was done by a court opinion that is not published or not officially published; e.g. "affirmed, by unreported decision" SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Canceled by	The citing reference indicates that registration for the trademark you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been canceled. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Cause Remanded by	An appellate court is returning the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to a lower court for further	Caution - Possible negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	proceedings and has used the specific language "cause remanded." SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Cause dismissed by	A court declines to consider any more issues of law or fact in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and uses the specific language "cause dismissed." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Cause re-set for submission by	On a motion of a party or on the court's own motion, the date originally set for submission of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been adjourned to a later date under Rule 171(b) of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Cause set for submission by	A writ of error has been granted in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and the date of submission to the Texas Supreme Court, with or without oral argument, has been set under Rule 12 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Cease and desist order issued	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), the Agency Commission has issued a cease and desist order directing a party to cease its unfair acts, including selling infringing imported articles out of U.S. inventory.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certificate filed at	The citing reference notes that a certificate for review of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been filed with the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Armed Forces. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Certificate for question declined at	Having received a certified question from the court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), a court declines to answer the question. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certificate of appealability denied by	Certificate of appealability denied is used when a trial court or an appellate court has denied a certificate of appealability for a specific case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certificate of appealability granted by	Certificate of appealability granted is used when a trial court or an appellate court has granted a certificate of appealability for a specific case.	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certificate of probable cause denied by	The court has not found reasonable grounds for allowing a party to bring an appeal from the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certificate of probable cause granted by	The court has found valid grounds for allowing a party to bring an appeal from the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Certification denied by	An appellate court has decided not to review the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certification dismissed by	An appellate court has refused to consider whether or not to review the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certification granted	Certification has been granted for the New Jersey opinion you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) but the case has been later affirmed on appeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certification granted by	An appellate court has agreed to review the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Certified question answered by	This term indicates a court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has abstained from deciding a question of law and has submitted the matter to an appropriate court, which subsequently rules on the question so certified. This often occurs between federal and state courts on questions of state law. It is also very common in the State of Florida between the state Supreme Court and a District Court of Appeals. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Certiorari or review denied by	The citing order denies certiorari or review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Charge dismissed by	The court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has determined that there is an absence of support of a claim, and has disposed of that matter without a hearing. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Cited by	The citing document references the Shepardized cite. SHEPARD'S Signal: Cited by. (Light Blue)	No Signal
Cited in Concurring Opinion at	A concurring opinion cites the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Cited in Dissenting Opinion at	A dissenting opinion cites the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Cited in depublished concurring opinion at	A concurring opinion cites the case or statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Cited in depublished dissenting opinion at	A dissenting opinion cites the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Cited in questionable precedent at	The citing case is of questionable precedential value because it has been ordered depublished and/or review has been granted by the California Supreme Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Claim allowed by	The phrase will usually indicate that a bankruptcy court has granted a creditor's action against the debtor for a disputed monetary sum in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), though it may also be used in a more general context outside of bankruptcy to show that the court has found in favor of a cause of action in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Claim disallowed by	This phrase is most often used to show that a bankruptcy court has denied a creditor's action against the debtor for a disputed monetary sum in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but it can also indicate, outside the bankruptcy context, that a cause of action by a party in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Claim dismissed by	denied by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue) A court disposes of certain claims in the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and usually indicates those claims will not be considered further. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Clarified by	The citing decision clarifies the revenue ruling or revenue procedure you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Clarified by	An opinion had been rendered for the sole purpose of explaining the intent and meaning of the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase is used where the court does not agree to rehear arguments on the earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Class certification denied by	The court does not recognize an ascertainable class in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and will not allow one or more parties to sue or be sued as a representatives of the class without formally naming every member of the class; or the court does not accept that the named representative adequately represents the interests of the rest of the class. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Class certification granted by	The court in case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) recognizes that the interests of a significantly large number of people are affected, and will allow one or more to sue or be sued as representatives of that class without the need to formally name or join every member of the class. Basically, the court believes it to be impracticable for every interested party to appear before the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Commissioner acquiesces in results only at	The Commission acquiesces in result only, and not in the reasoning employed to reach the result, in the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Companion case at	A court or administrative opinion has specifically referred to another action as a "companion	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	case," "companion proceeding," "companion appeal" or in some similar manner to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Complaint dismissed at	The court has acted to nullify the complaint in the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Complaint issued	The citing agency has acted to issue a complaint in the action you are SHEPARDIZING(T). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Concurring Opinion at	A separate decision has been published in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), in which one or more judges agree with the prior majority decision but upon different grounds. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Concurring opinion in part and dissenting opinion in part at	A separate decision has been reported in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), in which one or more judges agree in part and disagree in part with the prior majority decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Concurring opinion withdrawn, substituted at	A separately reported concurring opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been negated and supplanted by a different concurring decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Confirmation denied by	A court has disapproved a proposed plan for reorganization upon a motion by the debtor in the bankruptcy proceeding you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Confirmation granted by	A court has approved a proposed plan for reorganization upon a motion by the debtor in the bankruptcy proceeding that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Confirmation revoked by	Typically, the Bankruptcy Court is revoking the previously granted confirmation of the plan for reorganization in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). However, this phrase may be used with other courts and/or outside the bankruptcy context if appropriate. SHEPARD'S	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Conformed to	The court enters an order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in compliance with a directive from a higher appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Connected case at	The citing case is related to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), arising out of the same subject matter or involving the same parties. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Connected case, questionable precedent at	The citing case is related to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), arising out of the same subject matter or involving the same parties. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Constitutional by	The citing case upholds the constitutionality of the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Constitutional by questionable precedent at	The citing case, which has been ordered not published, upholds the constitutionality of the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Conversion denied by	The court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) refuses to allow a debtor to refile and proceed under a different chapter of the Bankruptcy Code. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Conversion granted by	The court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) allows a motion by the debtor to refile and proceed under a different chapter of the Bankruptcy Code. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Converted by	A bankruptcy court of its own volition changes the chapter/rules under which the proceeding you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) will be heard.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Corrected by	For regulations, the citing reference corrects an error in the regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). For case law, the court has issued a corrected opinion which has changed or revised its own judgment, order or opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in one or more ways, generally by removing errors, defects or omissions, thereby limiting the continuing validity or precedential value of the earlier case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Correction certificate issued at	The citing reference indicates that a correction certificate has been issued for the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Costs and fees proceeding at	This phrase is used to reflect post-trial proceedings for counsel fees or court costs in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) or when a post-trial motion for counsel fees or court costs is raised. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Count dismissed at	The court disposes of certain counts in the complaint in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and usually indicates they will not be considered further. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Criticized	The citing opinion criticizes the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in some significant way, although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value.	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Criticized as noted in concurring opinion	A concurring opinion criticizes the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in some significant way, although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Criticized as stated in	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been criticized on one or more points by a subsequent decision from a court at the same or higher level, according to the opinion of the citing case, thereby casting	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	some doubt on the precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Criticized but reluctantly followed as stated in	The decision of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been criticized on one or more points, but nevertheless was followed as precedent in a subsequent decision from a court at the same or lower court level, according to the opinion of the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Criticized but reluctantly followed by	An opinion of a court has expressed a lack of harmony with the decision of the court of equal or higher rank in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but feels constrained to follow the precedent set by the case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Criticized by	The citing opinion disagrees with the reasoning/result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Criticized by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion disagrees with the reasoning/result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Criticized by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion criticizes the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in some significant way, although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects the precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Criticized in	This phrase is used when either (1) A court has expressed its disagreement with some point of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), without overruling the decision or (2) A court is noting that disharmony exists between two or	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	more prior decisions. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Criticized in Concurring Opinion at	The cited opinion disagrees with the reasoning/result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Criticized in Concurring Opinion by questionable precedent at	The concurring opinion criticizes the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in some significant way, although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Criticized in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The cited opinion disagrees with the reasoning/result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), although the citing court may not have the authority to materially affect its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Decision for Government at	The citing decision holds for the Government in a dispute concerning the Code section you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Decision for Government in part at	The citing decision holds in part for the Government in a dispute concerning the Code section you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Decision for Taxpayer at	The citing decision holds for the taxpayer in a dispute concerning the Code section you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Decision for Taxpayer in part at	The citing decision holds in part for the taxpayer in a dispute concerning the Code section you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Decision reached on appeal by	An appellate court has reached a final decision on the merits of an appeal, but the specific lower court decision from which the appeal arose is not yet available. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Dedicated to public by	The citing reference indicates that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been dedicated to the public. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dedicated to public in part by	The citing reference indicates that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) have been dedicated to the public. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dedicated to public, disclaimer filed by	The citing reference indicates that the patent you SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been dedicated to the public and disclaimed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Demurrer overruled by	A party to the state action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) argues his opponent's complaint fails to set forth a cause of action upon which relief can be granted; the court has specifically overruled the request. This motion is equivalent to a federal "motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim on which relief may be granted." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Demurrer sustained by	A party to the state action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) argues that his opponent's complaint fails to set forth a cause of action upon which relief can be granted; the court has sustained the request and will normally dismiss the action. This motion is equivalent to a federal "motion to dismiss for failure to state a claim on which relief may be granted." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Denial of writ of error withdrawn	The Texas Supreme Court has withdrawn an order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) denying a writ of error on the motion of a party under Rule 134 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Different results reached on reconsideration by	A court has reheard/revisited the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and arrives at a conclusion different from that reached in the earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Different results reached on rehearing at	When a court rehears the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and arrives at a conclusion different from that reached in its own earlier decision, but does not specify that the earlier	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	decision is, itself, modified. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	
Digest opinion at	A brief synopsis of the opinion you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) appears at the citation indicated. This phrase is often found in the context of cases involving the Occupational Safety and Health Administration. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Direct appeal filed by	The citing reference notes the filing of a direct appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Disapproved as stated in	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been rejected on one or more points by the subsequent decision from a higher court, according to the opinion of the citing case, thereby casting some doubt on the precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange)	Questioned - Validity questioned by citing references (Orange)
Disapproved by	An opinion of a higher court has expressed a lack of harmony with the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), thereby casting some doubt on the continuing validity or precedential value of the lower court case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Disapproved in	This phrase is primarily encountered in Florida Supreme Court opinions where the court rejects the reasoning of the District Court of Appeals decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Discharge denied by	A debtor's request to be relieved of an obligation to repay their debts has been refused by a bankruptcy court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Discharge granted by	A bankruptcy court finds that the debtor's claim in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is dischargeable and relieves them of the obligation to repay their debt. SHEPARD'S	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Discharge revoked by	Typically, the Bankruptcy Court is revoking the previously granted discharge of a claim in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) from a debtor's bankruptcy. However, this phrase may be used with other courts and/or outside the bankruptcy context if appropriate. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Discharged by	A court is releasing a party in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) from an obligation to satisfy a prior debt or claim. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Disclaimer filed and dedicated to public at	The citing reference indicates that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been disclaimed and dedicated to the public. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Disclaimer filed at	The citing reference indicates that a disclaimer has been entered as to the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Disclaimer filed in part at	The citing reference indicates that a disclaimer has been entered as to certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Disclaimer filed, US Government Owned at	The citing reference indicates that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been disclaimed and is owned by the U.S. government. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Discretionary appeal allowed by	An appellate court has accepted an appeal to review a lower court or agency judgment. Subsequently, the appeal has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Discretionary appeal allowed by	An appellate court has exercised its discretion to allow an appeal to review the lower court or agency judgment in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). It is similar to "appeal granted", but tracks the court's language more specifically. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Discretionary appeal not allowed by	An appellate court has exercised its discretion to not allow an appeal to review the lower court or agency judgment in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The earlier case is still good law and further appeal is possible if a higher court exists. It is similar to "appeal denied", but tracks the court's language more specifically. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dismissed by	The citing case dismisses an appeal from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dismissed without opinion by	A court opinion indicates that the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been dismissed without discussing any rationale. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dismissed without prejudice by	The case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been dismissed but not on the merits. The action may be revived in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dissenting Opinion at	A separate decision has been published in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), in which one or more judges disagree with the prior majority opinion. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dissenting opinion at, questionable precedent at	A dissenting opinion cites the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dissenting opinion modified at	This phrase indicates that one or more judges disagree with the majority opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Dissenting opinion withdrawn, substituted at	The dissenting opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been negated and supplanted by a different dissent. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Distinguished by	The case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been distinguished from the subsequent citing case by a higher court or by a later decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Distinguished by	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), either involving dissimilar facts or requiring a different application of the law. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Distinguished by questionable precedent at	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), either involving dissimilar facts or requiring a different application of the law. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Distinguished in Concurring Opinion at	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), either involving dissimilar facts or requiring a different application of law. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Distinguished in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), either involving dissimilar facts or requiring a different application of law. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
En banc	A phrase used in combination with some other history phrase (e.g., aff'd, en banc) to signify that all the judges of a court have met to decide a case, in contrast to a session of the court presided over by a single justice or panel of judges. This is significant because an 'en banc' decision is considered to have more precedential value or 'weight of authority'. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Enforced as modified by	The court decision or ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been changed and subsequently put into effect by a higher court. This phrase most often appears in cases to which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Enforced by	The court decision or ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been put into effect by a higher court. This phrase most often appears in cases in which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Enforced in part and enforcement denied in part by	The court decision or ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been only partially put into effect by a higher court. This phrase most often appears in cases to which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Enforced in part and vacated in part by	The court decision or ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been partially put into effect and partially nullified by a higher court. This phrase most often appears in cases to which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Enforced in part, enforcement denied in part, and remanded in part by	The court decision or ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been partially put into effect by a higher court. The part(s) of the decision not put into effect have been remanded to the lower court. This phrase most often appears in cases to which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Enforced without opinion by	The court decision or ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been put into effect by a higher court, but the court does not discuss any rationale applied in reaching this decision. This phrase most often appears in cases to which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Enforcement denied and remanded by	An appellate court has reviewed the lower court order or administrative ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and declined to grant a decree to put into effect, while returning the case to the lower court or agency for some further proceeding. This phrase is often used with labor cases in which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Enforcement denied by	An appellate court has reviewed the lower court order or administrative ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and declined to grant a decree to put it into effect. This phrase is often used with labor cases in which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Enforcement denied without opinion by	<p>Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p> <p>An appellate court has reviewed the lower court order or administrative ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and declined to grant a decree to put it into effect, but without a written opinion discussing its reasons for denying enforcement. This phrase is often used with labor cases in which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Enforcement granted by	<p>An appellate court has reviewed an upheld the lower court order or administrative ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and granted a decree to put it into effect. This phrase is often used with cases in which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)</p>	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Enforcement granted in part and denied in part by	<p>An appellate court has only partially upheld the lower court order or administrative ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and granted a decree to only partially put it into effect. This phrase is often used with labor cases in which the National Labor Relations Board is a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Examiner's decision at	<p>The examiner's decision cites the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Exception to discharge denied by	<p>This phrase is used in connection with bankruptcy proceedings to reflect a court's negative response to a creditor's complaint in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) seeking an exception to the discharge of a debt. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Exception to discharge granted by	<p>This phrase is used in connection with bankruptcy proceedings to reflect a court's positive response to a creditor's complaint in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) seeking an exception to the discharge of a debt. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Exceptions overruled by	Reflecting the court language, this phrase is used in response to an objection to an order or ruling of the trial court in the case you SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Exceptions sustained by	Reflecting the court's language, this phrase is used in response to an objection to an order or ruling of the trial court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Exclusion order issued	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM) the Agency Commission has issued an exclusion order which bars the importation of infringing goods and entry of excluded articles into the United States.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Exemption allowed by	This phrase is used in bankruptcy proceedings when the court has determined that certain property in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) will be exempt from inclusion in the bankruptcy estate. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Exemption disallowed by	This phrase is used in bankruptcy proceedings when the court has determined that certain property in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) will not be exempt and will be included in the bankruptcy estate. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Explained by	The citing opinion interprets or clarifies the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in a significant way. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Explained by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion interprets or clarifies the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in a significant way. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Explained in Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion interprets or clarifies the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in a significant way. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Explained in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion interprets or clarifies the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in a significant way. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Extended by	The citing reference extends the scope of, or the time period specified in, the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Extension granted by	The citing reference indicates that an extension has been granted as to the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Extension granted in part by	The citing reference indicates that an extension has been granted as to certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Extension refused by	The citing reference indicates that an extension has been refused as to the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Final Determination	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), an agency commission or board has rendered a determinative opinion /ruling based on an investigation into alleged violations.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Findings of fact/conclusions of law at	The court has evaluated the facts and evidence presented in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and arrived at a determination regarding the final judgment. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Followed by	The citing opinion addresses an issue regarding the application of statutes, rules or regulations and expressly finds the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) applicable to the legal or factual circumstances of the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Followed by	The citing opinion relies on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) as controlling or persuasive authority. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Followed by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion, which has been ordered depublished, expressly relies on the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) as controlling authority. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Followed by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion relies on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) as controlling or persuasive authority. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Followed in Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion relies on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) as controlling or persuasive authority. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Followed in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion relies on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) as controlling or persuasive authority. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Followed in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	In a concurring opinion, the cited statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is considered by the citing opinion as controlling authority with respect to the legal or factual circumstances of the citing case, and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Followed in a concurring opinion at	The concurring opinion addresses an issue regarding the application of statutes, rules or regulations and expressly finds the statute, rule, or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) applicable to the legal or factual circumstances of the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Government owned patent at	The citing reference indicates that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is owned by the U.S. government. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Grant of writ of error withdrawn	After submission of the case, the Texas Supreme Court has determined that the Court of Appeals has rendered a correct judgment in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and that a writ of error should not have been granted under Rule 133 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Granted and Citable by	The citing reference grants review of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and orders that it remains published. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Habeas corpus denied by	The citing order refuses to issue a writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Habeas corpus proceeding at	Following the conviction in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), the prisoner has brought an action that does not bear on the issue of guilt or innocence, but rather questions whether the petitioner was denied due process or other constitution right(s) during his trial. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Harmonized by	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but the citing court reconciles the difference or inconsistency in reaching its decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Harmonized by questionable precedent at	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but the citing court reconciles the difference or inconsistency in reaching its decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Harmonized in Concurring Opinion at	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but the citing court reconciles the difference or inconsistency in reaching its decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Harmonized in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing case differs from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but the citing court reconciles the difference or inconsistency in reaching its decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Hearing denied by Supreme Court as reported in	A court notes that the earlier, unrelated decision by the California Court of Appeals has become final, with the California Supreme Court refusing a petition for hearing of that case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Hearing denied by Supreme Court by	The California Supreme Court has denied a petition for a hearing after the decision of the Court of Appeals has become final under the California Rules of Appellate Procedure.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Hearing granted by Supreme Court by	The California Supreme Court, after the decision of the Court of Appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has become final, has ordered the cause of the decision appealed from transferred to itself for hearing and decision under the California Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Hearing granted by Supreme Court, appeal dismissed by	The California Supreme Court, after the decision of the Court of Appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has become final, has ordered the cause transferred to itself for hearing, and has turned down the appeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Hearing granted by Supreme Court, transferred by	Following the decision by the Court of Appeals in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), the California Supreme Court has agreed to a hearing on the matter and has transferred the action to its court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Held in Abeyance at	An application for leave to appeal has been held in abeyance pending resolution of another case or cases. Subsequently, the application has been denied or discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Held in abeyance at	The citing reference orders that an application for leave to appeal be held in abeyance pending resolution of another case or cases. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Held in abeyance at	An application for leave to appeal has been held in abeyance in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pending the resolution of another case or cases.	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Improved at	The citing reference adds an improvement to the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
In part	A court has rendered an opinion that is to some extent limited in its scope or application (i.e. an appellate court affirms some aspects of a lower court opinion while reversing on other points; or	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	grants a motion by a petitioner to some degree, while rejecting other parts of its). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Infringed by	The citing case holds that the patent, copyright or trademark you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Infringed in part by	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent, copyright or trademark you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Infringing by	The intellectual property citation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), was identified as infringing upon one or more other intellectual property citations. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Infringing in part by	The intellectual property citation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), was identified as partially infringing upon one or more other intellectual property citations. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Injunction denied by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has filed a motion for an injunction with the court to forbid the opposing party from doing or to require him to do some act; the court has denied the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Injunction filed at	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has filed a request with the court to forbid the defendant from doing or to require him to do some act. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Injunction granted at	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has filed a motion for an injunction with the court to forbid the opposing party from doing or to require him to do some act; the court has granted the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Interim decision at	An interim decision, typically by an administrative law judge, cites the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Interlocutory appeal filed by	An appeal of the matter you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been filed; this appeal is not determinable of the dispute, but is nonetheless necessary for a suitable decision on the merits. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Interpreted in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	In a concurring opinion, the cited statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is explained in some significant way, and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Interpreted in a concurring opinion at	A concurring opinion interprets the statute, rule, or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in some significant way, often including a discussion of its legislative history. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Interpreted or construed by	The citing opinion interprets the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in some significant way, often including a discussion of the statute's legislative history. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Interprets or construes by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion, which has been ordered depublished, interprets the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in some significant way, often including a discussion of the statute's legislative history. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Invalid in part, Disclaimer filed at	The citing reference notes that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is held void, invalid or unenforceable in part and a disclaimer has been filed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Invalid in part, questionable precedent at	The citing case, which has been ordered depublished, declares void or invalid part of the statute, rule, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because it conflicts with an authority that takes priority. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Invalid, Not Infringed in part at	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are void, invalid or unenforceable and/or not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Judgment entered by	This phrase is used to connote the fact that the court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has formally rendered an opinion determinative of the rights and obligations of the parties to the suit. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Jurisdiction discharged by	Having previously accepted jurisdiction over the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), the court now declines jurisdiction, determining that it does not have the power or authority to hear the case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Jurisdiction noted by	The Supreme Court has entered an order noting probable jurisdiction of an appeal, after the appellant had filed a jurisdictional statement pursuant to the court rules. Subsequently, the appeal has been denied or discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Jurisdiction noted by	A phrase used only with Supreme Court cases, when the court has entered an order noting probable jurisdiction of the appeal of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), after the appellant has filed a jurisdictional statement pursuant to the court rules. There will likely be a subsequent opinion by the court to indicate its disposition on the merits of the appeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Jurisdiction postponed by	A phrase generally used with Supreme Court and Federal District Court cases, when the court has entered an order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) deferring its decision on accepting jurisdiction in the case until questions regarding the authority of the court to take jurisdiction are answered. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Later proceeding at	This phrase is used to connect together cases from the same direct litigation chain, when the	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	use of a more specific or dispositive phrase is not appropriate or possible. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Leave to Appeal Dismissed	The citing order dismisses a motion / petition / application for leave to appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Leave to Appeal Granted	The citing order grants a motion / petition / application for leave to appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution-Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Leave to appeal denied by	The citing order denies a motion / petition / application for leave to appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Leave to appeal granted by	A motion, petition or other form of application for leave to appeal the cited case has been granted. Subsequently, the appeal has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
License issued by	An agency has granted an application or request for the first license issued in a matter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
License reissued	An agency has granted a subsequent application or request for another license for a previously licensed matter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Limited by	In case law, the citing opinion restricts the application of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), finding its reasoning applies only in specific, limited circumstances. For statutes, regulations or administrative rulings, the citing reference refuses to extend the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Limited by, questionable precedent at	The citing opinion restricts the application of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), finding that its reasoning applies only in specific, limited circumstances. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Limited in Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion restricts the application of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), finding that its reasoning applies only in specific, limited circumstances. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Limited in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion restricts the application of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), finding that its reasoning applies only in specific, limited circumstances. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Limited, Infringed by	The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is limited and infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Limited, Not Infringed by	The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is limited and not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Limited, Not Infringed in part by	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are limited and not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Limited, not infringed, void by	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are limited, not infringed, and void, invalid or unenforceable. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Magistrate's recommendation at	A judicial officer, having some but no all the powers of a federal District Court judge, has made a preliminary or pretrial findings in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). Generally such recommendations will eventually be considered by a judge. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Mandamus dismissed by	The citing order dismisses petition for writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Mandate issued in	A mandate has been issued from the United States Court of Appeals for the Armed Forces in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Modification denied by	A party to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court to change or revise its	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	earlier decision; the court has denied the request, specifically using the phrase "modification denied." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Modification order at	The citing order modifies or changes in some way the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S signal: Cited and neutral analysis indicated. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated.(Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Modified and rehearing denied by	On a motion for rehearing of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), a court has agreed to modify the decision but refuses to rehear the case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Modified by	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case modifies or changes in some way, including affirmance in part and reversal in part, the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Modified by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, modifies the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Modified by questionable precedent at	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case modifies or changes in some way, including affirmance in part and reversal in part, the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Modified in	A treatment phrase used only between older INS cases. The ruling in the INS decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been modified or altered by the subsequent decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Modified in part and reversed in part by	An appellate court has modified part of the judgment of the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and has overturned the remainder of it. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Moot	Having determined that a case is moot, the Texas Supreme Court has granted petition for review or petition for mandamus and, without having heard argument, has dismissed the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) or the appealable portion of it without addressing the merits. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion denied by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court for a rule or order directing some act to be done in their favor; the court has denied the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion dismissed by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court for a rule or order directing some act to be done in their favor; the court refuses to consider the motion - usually due to mootness. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for extension of time overruled by	A motion to extend the time to file a petition for review has been overruled in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for new trial denied by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court to set aside the judgment and order a new trial, arguing that the trial was unfair or improper due to the occurrence of specified prejudicial errors; the court has denied the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for new trial granted by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court to set aside the judgment and order a new trial, arguing that the trial was unfair or improper due to occurrence of specified prejudicial errors; the court has granted the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Motion for rehearing on petition for discretionary review denied by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for discretionary review under Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure has been denied. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for rehearing on petition for discretionary review dismissed by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for discretionary review under Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Procedure has been dismissed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for rehearing on petition for discretionary review granted by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for discretionary review under Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure has been granted in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Motion for rehearing on petition for discretionary review granted by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for discretionary review has been granted. Subsequently, rehearing has been discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for rehearing on petition for discretionary review overruled by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for discretionary review under Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure has been overruled. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for rehearing on petition for discretionary review refused by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for discretionary review under Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure has been refused. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for rehearing on petition for review denied by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for review by the Texas Supreme Court has been denied in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for rehearing on petition for review granted by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for review by the Texas Supreme Court has been granted in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Motion for rehearing on petition for review granted by	A motion for rehearing on a petition for review has been granted in the cited case. Subsequently, rehearing has been discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion for rehearing on petition for review overruled by	The motion of a party for rehearing of an argument on a petition for review by the Texas Supreme Court has been overruled in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Motion granted by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved a court for a rule or order directing some act to be done in their favor; the court has granted the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion overruled by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court for a rule or order directing some act to be done in their favor; the court has overruled the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion refused by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court for a rule or order directing some act to be done in their favor; the court has rejected the request, specifically using the phrase "motion refused." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion sustained by	A party to the action you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court for a rule or order directing some act to be done in their favor; the court has granted the request, specifically using the phrase "motion sustained." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to certify record allowed by	The motion of a party to certify the record of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been allowed. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases which are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to certify withdrawn by	The motion of a party to certify the record of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases which are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to dismiss appeal denied by	A party to the action has moved the appellate court to refuse to consider an appeal from the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM); the appellate court has denied the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to dismiss appeal withdrawn by	A request that an appellate court refuse to consider an appeal from the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn upon the request by the moving party.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Motion to modify denied by	A court has denied a request to change or alter its decision in the case you SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to set aside overruled by	A court has rejected a request to abandon the decision of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM); the request is specifically identified as a "motion to set aside." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to strike denied by	A court has refused to have some element of the pleading in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) stricken from the record, such as a defense or cause of action, or has refused a request specifically identified as a "motion to strike." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to strike granted by	At the request of the one of the parties, the court has stricken a defense or cause of action from the pleading in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), or has granted a request specifically identified as a "motion to strike." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion to vacate denied by	A court has denied a request to abandon the decision of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM); the request is specifically identified as a "motion to vacate." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motion withdrawn by	A motion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pending before a court has ended upon request of the moving party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Motions ruled upon by	This phrase is generally used when multiple motions are heard in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and resolved within a single opinion. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Negatively impacted by legislation	A subsequent enactment explicitly expresses legislative intent to overrule the case in whole or in part. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Nonacquiescence by Commissioner at	The Commissioner does not agree with the legal reasoning or result of the case you are	Warning - Negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARDIZING(TM) which was decided against the IRS. The IRS may take an appeal, if timely, or relitigate any issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	treatment is indicated (Red)
Nonacquiescence by Commissioner at	The Commissioner refuses to acquiesce in the reasoning or result of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Nonacquiescence by Commissioner in part at	The Commissioner does not agree with some of the issues or part of the result in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) which was decided against the IRS. The IRS may take an appeal, if timely, or relitigate those issues not agreed with in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Nonacquiescence by Commissioner in part withdrawn at	Although the Commissioner has previously disagreed with some of the issues and a portion of result in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) which was decided against the IRS, that disagreement is reversed. The IRS may not take an appeal, or relitigate in the future, any parts of the decision with which the Commissioner did not previously agree. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Nonacquiescence by Commissioner withdrawn at	Although the Commissioner had previously disagreed with the legal reasoning or with the result of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) which was decided against the IRS, that disagreement is reversed. The IRS may not take an appeal on any issues and may not relitigate those issues in the future. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Nonacquiescence by Commissioner withdrawn in part at	Although the Commissioner had previously disagreed with the legal reasoning, or with the result, of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) which was decided against the IRS, that disagreement is reversed as to some issues and part of the result. The IRS may not take an appeal or relitigate in the future those issues as to which disagreement has been reversed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Not Citable, Order Not Published (see Cal. R. of Ct.)	Pursuant to California Rules of Court, this case is of questionable precedential	Warning - Negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	value because it is unpublished or because it has been ordered depublished. (Publication status should be verified before using the case in California.) SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red).	treatment is indicated (Red)
Not Recommended for Publication by	The citing reference concludes that the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recommended for publication. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Not applicable by questionable precedent in	The citing opinion, which has been ordered depublished , expressly finds the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) inapplicable to the legal or factual circumstances of the citing case. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Not applicable in	The citing opinion expressly finds the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) inapplicable to the legal or factual circumstances of the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Not applicable in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	In a concurring opinion, the cited statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is held to be inapplicable to the legal issue or factual circumstances of the citing case, and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Not applicable in concurring opinion at	The concurring opinion expressly finds the statute, rule, or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) inapplicable to the legal or factual circumstances of the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Not followed as stated in	The decision of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has not been followed on one or more points in a subsequent decision from a lower court, according to the opinion of the citing case, thereby casting some doubt on the precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed by	An opinion of a lower court has expressed a lack of harmony with the decision of the higher court	Caution - Possible negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), thereby casting doubt on the continuing validity or precedential value of the higher court case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 10th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Tenth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 11th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 1st Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the First Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 2nd Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Second Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 3rd Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Third Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Not followed except in 4th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Fourth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 5th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Fifth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 6th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Sixth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 7th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Seventh Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 8th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Eighth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in 9th Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Not followed except in D.C. Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the District of Columbia Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed except in Federal Circuit at	The higher court decision in the case in you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value except in the Federal Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 10th Circuit by	The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Tenth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 11th Circuit by	The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Eleventh Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 1st Circuit by	The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the First Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 2d Circuit by	The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Second Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Not followed in 3d Circuit by	<p>Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p> <p>The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Third Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 4th Circuit by	<p>The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Fourth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 5th Circuit by	<p>The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Fifth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 6th Circuit by	<p>The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Sixth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 7th Circuit by	<p>The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Seventh Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in 8th Circuit by	<p>The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Eighth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Not followed in 9th Circuit by	The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Ninth Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in D.C. Circuit by	The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the District of Columbia Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not followed in Federal Circuit by	The higher court decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not recognized as having precedential value in the Federal Circuit Court of Appeals. This phrase is found in subsequent treatment history of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Not infringed by	The citing case holds that the patent, copyright or trademark you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Not infringed in part by	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Not published by	The citing reference orders the Reporter of Decisions not to publish the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Notice of appeal dismissed by	A document declaring the intention to appeal has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) with the appellate court and served upon the opposing party; without consideration, the court has refused to accept the notice, usually because the appellant has failed to follow proper procedural rules for filing such a notice. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Nullified by	The citing case nullifies the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Objection denied by	This phrase generally indicates that an argument in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been rejected by the court. In the specific context of a bankruptcy proceeding, it means that a creditor's objection to a debtor's proposal for reorganization has been refused. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Objection granted by	An objection or challenge by a party has been granted in the case you are SHPEARDIZING (TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Objection overruled by	A party's argument in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is not sustained. This term is frequently encountered in bankruptcy proceedings where a creditor objects to a proposed reorganization by the debtor; generally, where the plan is confirmed, the creditor's objection has been denied or overruled. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Objection sustained by	A party has raised an argument in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and the court has upheld it. In the context of a bankruptcy proceeding, it indicates that a court has found merit to a creditor's challenge of the debtor's proposed reorganization. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Obsoleted by	The citing reference, typically a record of administrative action, renders obsolete the regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Obsoleted by	Obsoleted is used when the citing decision renders obsolete the cited statute or regulation.	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Obsoleted in part by	The citing reference, typically a record of administrative action, renders obsolete part of the regulation or order you are	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
On reconsideration by	SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red) A second or further consideration of a matter has been undertaken by the court that rendered the original decision. On that reconsideration, the court expressly adheres to the entirety of the original decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
On reconsideration by	Similar to "on rehearing", a court has decided to reexamine the prior decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but usually without any further argument by the parties, in order to correct an error or address a new issue. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
On rehearing at	This phrase indicates a second consideration of the matter by same court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), often with additional argument by the parties, for the purpose of correcting or clarifying the prior order or to address a newly raised issue. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
On rehearing at	A second or further consideration of a matter has been undertaken by the court that rendered the original decision. On that rehearing, the court expressly adheres to the entirety of the original decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
On remand at	The case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been sent back from the appellate court to the lower court from which the proceeding originated, to take some further action on it. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
On reopening at	Indicates that a court has reopened a prior judgment or proceeding and has disposed of the relevant issues raised on reopening the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). Use if a court both grants reopening and re-examines its previous decision all in the same opinion. This phrase may be combined with other dispositional language. ("modified, on reopening"; "reaff'd, on reopening") SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Opinion replaced by	The court opinion which has been withdrawn in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been supplanted with a new opinion. This phrase is used to track specific court language. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Opinion to remain citable by	The opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has not been ordered published, but remains citable as an exception to Rule 8.1115 of the California Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Opinion withdrawn by	The court has negated the effectiveness of the opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Opinion withdrawn by order of court at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) previously certified for publication has been ordered not published by the issuing court or a higher court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Opinions combined at	Unlike most other history terms, this phrase does not reflect an action taken by a court, but rather seeks to clarify how different legal publishers have reported various opinions. Typically, it will denote where two opinions previously published as separate decisions by LEXIS have been "combined" and published as one decision by West Publishing in its regional reporter system. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Opposite judgment in appeal on question of law and fact by	An appellate court has rendered a judgment in appeal on question of law and fact that is opposite to that rendered by the court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The phrase is used only with older Ohio cases that are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Order dismisses appeal with opinion at	The citing order dismisses, with opinion, an appeal from the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Ordered not citable by	The Ohio unpublished decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been ordered "not	Warning - Negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	citable" (except as law of the case). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (RED)	treatment is indicated (Red)
Ordered published by	The opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that was not certified for publication has been ordered published. California cases are ordered published by the California Supreme Court under the Rules of California Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Original Issue at	The citing patent is the original issue of the reissue patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled as Noted in Concurring Opinion	The citing concurring opinion notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been overruled or disapproved, either expressly or effectively, in an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled as atated in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing concurring opinion notes that the continuing validity of an earlier opinion you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been overruled in an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled as stated in	The decision of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been completely overruled by a subsequent decision from the same court, according to opinion of the citing case, thereby casting doubt on the precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange)	Questioned - Validity questioned by citing references (Orange)
Overruled as stated in	The citing case notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been expressly or effectively overruled or disapproved in an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange)	Questioned - Validity questioned by citing references (Orange)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Overruled as stated in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing concurring opinion notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been overruled or disapproved, either expressly or effectively, in an earlier decision. The citing concurring opinion, itself, may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled as stated in by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been overruled or disapproved, either expressly or effectively, in an earlier decision. The citing case, itself, may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled by	The citing case expressly or effectively overrules or disapproves all of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Overruled by questionable precedent at	The citing case expressly overrules or disapproves all or part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled in Concurring Opinion at	The citing case expressly overrules or disapproves all or part of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled in part as Noted in Concurring Opinion	The citing concurring opinion notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been partially overruled or disapproved, either expressly or effectively, in an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled in part as stated in	The citing opinion notes that the continuing validity of an earlier opinion you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been overruled in part in an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange)	Questioned - Validity questioned by citing references (Orange)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Overruled in part as stated in	The citing case notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been partially overruled or disapproved, either expressly or effectively, in an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange)	Questioned - Validity questioned by citing references (Orange)
Overruled in part as stated in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing concurring opinion notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been partially overruled or disapproved, either expressly or effectively, in an earlier decision. The citing case, itself, may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled in part as stated in by questionable precedent at	The citing case notes that the continuing validity of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is in question because it has been partially overruled or disapproved, either expressly or effectively, in an earlier decision. The citing case, itself, may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Overruled in part by	The citing case expressly or effectively overrules or disapproves part of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Overruled in part by questionable precedent at	The citing case expressly or effectively overrules or disapproves parts of the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Parallel at	The citing case relies on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) by describing it as "on all fours" or parallel to the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Parallel by questionable precedent at	The citing case relies on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) by describing it as "on all fours" or parallel to the citing case. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Parallel in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing case relies on the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) by describing it as "on all fours" or parallel to the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Partial summary judgment denied by	The court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has turned down a party's request that judgment be entered in their favor as a matter of law because of the absence of a genuine issue of fact. This phrase is similar to "summary judgment denied", except the motion has been directed to part of a claim, rather than the entire cause. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Partial summary judgment granted by	The court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) will allow a party to prevail as a matter of law due to a absence of a genuine issue of fact. This phrase is like "summary judgment granted", except that the party is limited their motion to some aspect of the claim, rather than the entire matter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Patent expired at	The citing reference indicates that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has expired for failure to pay maintenance fee. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Patent interpreted	A court has interpreted the terms and phrases of the cited patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition denied by	The citing reference notes that a petition in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been denied by the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Armed Forces; or a formal, written application requesting judicial action on some matter has been refused by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition dismissed by	The court has disposed of or set aside the written application seeking favor on some legal matter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition dismissed by agreement at	The citing order dismisses, by agreement of the parties, petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition dismissed for want of jurisdiction	The citing order dismisses, for want of jurisdiction, petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition dismissed judgment correct	The citing order dismisses petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), upholding the judgment as correct. In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is not satisfied that the opinion of the Court of Appeals is correct in all respects but opines that the application presents no error of law that requires reversal or is of such importance as to require correction. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition filed	The citing reference notes petition for discretionary review has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for review granted, jdmt vacated w/o reference to the merits	The Texas Supreme Court grants, without reference to the merits, a petition for review and vacates judgment in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for certiorari filed at	The United States Supreme Court is presently deciding whether or not to review the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This is a temporary indicator of history; once the Supreme Court either grants or denies certiorari, the phrase will be deleted and replaced by the appropriate history. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for discretionary review denied	The citing order denies petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). In Texas, four of the judges of the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals have voted to deny a petition for discretionary review under Rule 202 (k) of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for discretionary review dismissed	The citing order dismisses or strikes petition for discretionary review in the case you are	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARDIZING(TM). In Texas, five judges of the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals have determined that discretionary review was improvidently granted under Rule 202(k) of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for discretionary review dismissed, untimely filed by	A petition for discretionary review which was not filed within the specified time period, but nonetheless was granted in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), has been dismissed under Rules 202(b) and 202(k) of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for discretionary review granted	The citing order grants petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for discretionary review granted	A discretionary review has been allowed. Subsequently, review has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for discretionary review granted by	Four judges of the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals have voted to grant a petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) under Rule 202 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for discretionary review improvidently granted by	At least five judges of the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals have voted to dismiss a petition for discretionary review that was improvidently granted in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for discretionary review refused	The citing order refuses petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Court of Appeals opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has the same precedential value as an opinion of the Texas Supreme Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for discretionary review refused by	Four judges of the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals have voted not to grant a petition for discretionary review in the case you are	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARDIZING(TM) under Rule 202(k) of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for discretionary review refused, untimely filed by	A petition for discretionary review filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been refused or dismissed because it was not filed within the specified time period under Rule 202(b) of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for rehearing denied	The citing order denies rehearing of a petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for rehearing granted	The citing order grants rehearing of a petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for relief denied by	The court has turned down an application filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) seeking satisfaction on some issue. This phrase is often encountered in bankruptcy proceedings, where a debtor hopes to avoid a judgment being placed upon their assets. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for relief granted by	A formal request for satisfaction on some issue filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been upheld by the court. This phrase is often encountered in bankruptcy proceedings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review abated by	The Texas Supreme Court has abated a petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because of the bankruptcy filing of the petitioner or until a lower court has rendered judgment to effectuate a settlement agreement. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for review abated by	A petition for review has been abated in the cited case because of the bankruptcy filing of the petitioner or pending judgment on a settlement agreement. Subsequently, the petition has been denied, refused, withdrawn, vacated or	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	dismissed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Petition for review denied by	The Texas Supreme Court denies petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review dismissed by	The Texas Supreme Court has dismissed or struck petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review dismissed by agreement at	The Texas Supreme Court dismisses, by agreement of the parties, petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review dismissed for want of jurisdiction by	The Texas Supreme Court dismisses, for want of jurisdiction, petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review filed	The filing of a petition for review in the cited case has been noted. Subsequently, that petition for review has been denied, refused, quashed, overruled, withdrawn, vacated or dismissed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review filed	A petition for review has been filed in the case that you are Shepardizing (TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for review granted by	The Texas Supreme Court grants petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for review granted by	A petition for review has been granted. Subsequently, review has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review granted on court's motion	The citing order grants, on court's own motion, petition for discretionary review of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for review granted without reference to the merits by	The Texas Supreme Court grants, without reference to the merits, a petition for review and remands the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	for rendition of judgment according to a settlement agreement of the parties. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Petition for review refused as untimely	The citing order refuses, as untimely filed, petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review refused by	The Texas Supreme Court refuses petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The Court of Appeals opinion that you are SHEPARDIZING (TM) has the same precedential value as an opinion of the Supreme Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Petition for review refused without prejudice	The citing order refuses, without prejudice, petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review reinstated by	A petition for review, that was previously abated, has been reinstated in the cited case. Subsequently, review has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition for review reinstated by	The Texas Supreme Court has reinstated a petition for review previously abated in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition for review withdrawn by	Petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn by the Texas Supreme Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition granted by	A formal application filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) seeking judicial relief on some issue has been upheld by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition granted by	The citing reference notes that a petition in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been granted by the U.S. Court of Appeals for the Armed Forces. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Petition granted without reference to merits	The citing order grants, without reference to the merits, petition for discretionary review and remands the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM)	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	for rendition of judgment according to a settlement agreement of the parties. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition improvidently granted	The citing order sets aside grant of review and dismisses petition or denies or refuses review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition overruled by	The court sets aside the formal application filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) seeking relief on some legal matter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition refused by	The court declines to consider a formal application filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) seeking satisfaction on some legal matter. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition refused for want of merit	The citing order refuses, for want of merit, petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is not satisfied that the opinion of the Court of Appeals is correct in all respects but opines that the application presents no error of law that requires reversal or is of such importance as to require correction. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition refused no reversible error	The citing order refuses petition for discretionary review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), finding no reversible error. In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is not satisfied that the opinion of the Court of Appeals is correct in all respects but opines that the application presents no error of law that requires reversal or is of such importance as to require correction. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Petition to recall mandate denied by	A party has formally applied to the court, requesting it to vacate an order previously rendered in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and the court has declined to grant said request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Petition withdrawn by	The court indicates that a previously submitted application seeking judicial relief filed in the case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn at the request of the petitioner. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Post-conviction proceeding at	This phrase indicates a proceeding under 28 U.S.C. Section 2255 has been filed in the case you SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Post-conviction relief denied at	A prisoner, attacking the constitutionality of his sentence in the case you SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved the court which imposed the sentence to vacate, set aside or correct it; the court has denied the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Post-conviction relief dismissed at	A prisoner, attacking the constitutionality of his sentence in the case you SHEPARDIZING(TM), has moved the court which imposed the sentence to vacate, set aside or correct it; the court has dismissed the request without consideration. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Post-conviction relief granted at	A prisoner, attacking the constitutionality of his sentence in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), has moved the court which imposed the sentence to vacate, set aside or correct it: the court has granted the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Precedential effect nullified by	A court of last resort orders that the decision of the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) shall have no precedential force or effect. This order is typically applied on denial/dismissal of review or appeal, or upon affirmance of the decision below. The lower court decision remains in effect, but carries no precedential weight following the nullification order. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Precedential effect stayed by	A court has issued a stay specifically to prevent the prior court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) from having any effect as a legal precedent. This phrase is typically used for	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Precedential effect stayed by	Michigan cases. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red) The citing reference orders that the precedential effect of the cited case be stayed pending consideration of the application for leave to appeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Prior Letter Ruling at	The citing letter ruling incorporates the text of the letter ruling you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Prior art patent at	The patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), was identified as prior art for one or more patents at issue in the citing case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Prohibition denied by	A party's request that the proceeding you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) be terminated due to lack of jurisdiction has been refused by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Prohibition filed by	A petition for a writ of prohibition has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to Rule 121 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. This phrase is used in Texas. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Prohibition filed by	A petition for a writ of prohibition has been filed, pursuant to Rule 121, Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. Subsequently, the writ has been denied or the writ proceedings have been discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Prohibition writ denied at	The citing order denies a petition for writ of prohibition in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Prohibition writ denied with written order at	The citing order denies, with written opinion, application for writ of prohibition in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Protest denied by	The Board of Contract Appeals disagrees with the protester's allegations filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Protest dismissed by	The Board of Contract Appeals finds the protester's allegations filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) have no merit. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Protest granted by	The Board of Contract Appeals agrees with the protester's allegations filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Quashed by	A higher court has reversed the decision of the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase is most often used with Florida cases, to track specific court language. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Question certified by	One or more issues before the Court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) have been transferred or "certified" to a different court. The court to which the issue has been transferred will decide the issue at a future point in time. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Questioned by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion questions the continuing validity or precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because of intervening circumstances, including judicial or legislative overruling. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Questioned in Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion questions the continuing validity or precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because of intervening circumstances, including judicial or legislative overruling. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Questioned in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing opinion questions the continuing validity or precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because of intervening circumstances, including judicial or legislative overruling. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Re-enacted and renumbered by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through	Caution - Possible negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	reenactment and renumbering. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Re-enacted by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, reenacts the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Re-examination by	The citing reference indicates results of reexamination for the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Re-set of oral argument granted to	A Texas appellate court has agreed to reschedule the presentation of legal argument before it. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Reaffirmed	After further review, the court has maintained its decision to affirm the earlier lower court decision or one of its own earlier decisions. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Reargument denied by	This phrase is used when the court denies a party's request to reargue issues ruled upon in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reargument dismissed by	This phrase is used when the court dismisses a party's request to reargue issues ruled upon in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reargument granted by	This phrase is used when the court grants a party's request to reargue issues ruled upon in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Recalled by	An appellate court is revoking or vacating the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) for matters of fact. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Receded from	A court has lessened the precedential value of the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) by its decision in a subsequent decision. This phrase is found in subsequent history treatment of Immigration and Naturalization decisions only. SHEPARD'S	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Reconsideration denied by	<p>Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p> <p>The court has denied the motion of a party asking for additional deliberation of an issue or issues upon which the ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been made. The content and effect of the original decision of the court remain unchanged. The original decision continues to represent good law, pending the filing of an appeal, if any, in a higher tribunal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reconsideration dismissed by	<p>The court has declined to consider additional deliberation of an issue or issues upon which the ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been made. The content and effect of the original decision of the court remain unchanged. The original decision continues to represent good law, pending the filing of an appeal, if any, in a higher tribunal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reconsideration granted by	<p>A motion of a party, asking for additional deliberation on an issue or issues upon which an earlier ruling had been made, has been granted. Subsequently, reconsideration has been discontinued or the earlier, underlying ruling has been expressly adhered to in its entirety. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reconsideration granted by	<p>The court has granted the motion of party asking for additional deliberation of an issue or issues upon which the ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been made. The content and effect of the original decision of the court may be changed. The original decision may no longer represent good law. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Reconsideration/Rehearing denied by questionable precedent at	<p>An appellate court has denied the motion of a party asking for additional deliberation of an issue or issues upon which a ruling has been made or an opinion issued in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Reconsidering by	The citing decision or order reconsiders the decision or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Reference in	The citing decision or order involves the docket or project number you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reference withdrawn by	The U.S. District Court has determined that an issue raised in the course of the bankruptcy proceeding you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) will be withdrawn from the jurisdiction of the bankruptcy court to proceed from that point forward in the district court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reformed by	A ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reformed so as to be consistent with earlier rulings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Registration refused by	The citing reference indicates that the registration of the trademark you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been refused from the register. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Rehearing and appeal denied by	An appellate court is refusing to rehear its earlier review of the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and is also refusing to accept a new appeal from that same lower court decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing denied by	The court has denied the motion of a party to rehear arguments that resulted in the opinion of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). A full dispositional opinion will be forthcoming. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing dismissed by	A court is refusing to consider a motion to rehear the decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing granted by	The court has granted the motion of a party to rehear arguments that resulted in the opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM).	Caution - Possible negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing granted by	The motion of a judge or a party to rehear the arguments that resulted in the issuance of an earlier opinion has been granted. Subsequently, rehearing has been discontinued or the earlier, underlying ruling has been expressly adhered to in its entirety. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing granted in part and overruled in part by	A portion of a motion to rehear the arguments that resulted in the issuance of an earlier opinion has been granted, while another portion of that motion has been overruled. Subsequently, rehearing has been discontinued or the earlier, underlying ruling has been expressly adhered to in its entirety. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing granted in part and overruled in part by	A court has partially granted a motion to rehear the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), while specifically overruling the rest of that motion. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing granted, Depublished by	The citing reference grants rehearing of and depublishes the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to California Rules of Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Rehearing of 130D motion filed by	A motion for rehearing of the petition for an extension of time in which to file an application for a writ of error in the Court of Appeals has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing of cause filed by	A motion for the rehearing of a cause has been filed pursuant to Rule 64 (former Rule 190), Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. Subsequently, rehearing has been denied or discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing of cause filed by	This phrase is used in Texas. A motion for the rehearing of the cause has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure.	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Rehearing of cause overruled by	This phrase is used in Texas. A motion for the rehearing of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been overruled under Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing of direct appeal and cause filed by	This phrase is used in Texas. A motion for rehearing of a direct appeal and cause has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing of petition for review filed by	A party has filed a motion for a rehearing after the Texas Supreme Court has denied, refused or dismissed a petition for review in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) under Rule 56.5 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing of writ of error and Rule 90 filed	This phrase is used in Texas. A party has filed an application for rehearing in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) upon the denial, dismissal or refusal of writ of error, suspending publication until after the decision on rehearing is issued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing of writ of error and cause filed	A party has filed an application for rehearing in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) upon denial, dismissal or refusal of a writ of error and cause pursuant to Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing of writ of error filed	This phrase is used in Texas. A party has moved for rehearing of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) upon denial, dismissal or refusal of a writ of error, pursuant to Rule 134 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing of writ of error overruled	This phrase is used in Texas. A motion for rehearing in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) upon denial, dismissal or refusal of a writ of error has been overruled by	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	the Supreme Court under Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Rehearing of writ of habeas corpus overruled	This phrase is used in Texas. A motion for rehearing of a petition for habeas corpus filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been overruled pursuant to Rule 120 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing of writ of mandamus and writ of prohibition filed	This phrase is used in Texas. A motion for rehearing of a petition for a writ of mandamus and prohibition has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing of writ of mandamus filed	A motion for rehearing of a petition for a writ of mandamus has been filed pursuant to Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. Subsequently, rehearing has been denied or discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing of writ of mandamus filed	This phrase is used in Texas. A motion for rehearing of a petition for a writ of mandamus has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to Rule 190 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing of writ of mandamus overruled	A motion for rehearing of a petition for a writ of mandamus filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been overruled. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing or reconsideration denied	The citing order denies rehearing or reconsideration in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing or reconsideration granted by	The citing order grants rehearing or reconsideration in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing overruled by	A court has declined to reconsider the prior decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase is usually used in Texas appellate	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	courts. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing, en banc, denied by	The court has stated, or the text of the opinion indicates, that rehearing of the matter in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been denied en banc. This phrase may be used when drawn from the text of the opinion of a state supreme court. See 'en banc'. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rehearing, en banc, granted by	The court has stated or the text of the opinion indicates that the rehearing of the matter in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been granted en banc. This phrase may be used when drawn from the text of the opinion of a state supreme court. See 'en banc'. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Rehearing, en banc, granted by	An appellate court has allowed a request by one or more judges of the court or a party to have an earlier decision of a panel of the appellate court reheard by all of judges of the court. Subsequently, rehearing en banc has been discontinued or the earlier, underlying ruling has been expressly adhered to in its entirety. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reinstated by	A court has placed its decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in the same position as before the dismissal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reinstated by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, reinstates the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Reissue Patent	The citing patent is the reissue of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reissue by	The citing reference orders the Reporter of Decisions to publish the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), reversing a previous depublication order. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Reissue by questionable precedent at	The citing reference, which is questionable precedent, orders the Reporter of Decisions to publish the case you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), reversing a previous depublication order. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rejected by	A court declines to accept the reasoning of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase is commonly used to signify that a federal district court has "rejected" the recommendation of a magistrate, or that a National Labor Relations panel has found an Administrative Law Judge's decision unsatisfactory. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Related proceeding at	A phrase used to connect cases which seem to involve the same parties and arise out of the same facts or circumstances, but are resolved by the courts in separate and distinct legal proceedings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Relief from automatic stay denied	A bankruptcy court (or an appellate court sitting in review of a bankruptcy court decision) has denied a request to lift the automatic stay in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Relief from automatic stay granted by	A bankruptcy court (or an appellate court sitting in review of a bankruptcy court decision) has granted a request to lift the automatic stay in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Remanded by	An appellate court has returned the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to the lower court for entry of proper judgment, for a new trial or for some other further proceeding. There will likely be a subsequent judgment, order or opinion by the lower court indicating its disposition of the case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Remanded without opinion by	An appellate court has returned the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to the lower court for some further proceeding, but without any written opinion discussing its reasons for the remand.	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Remitted by	A higher court has sent the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to the lower court for further consideration. This phrase is typically used by New York courts. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Remittitur amended by	A party to an action has filed a motion asking a higher court to amend or change its decision to order the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) returned to a lower court for further proceedings; the court grants the request and amends the remittitur. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Remittitur denied by	A court has refused the request to reduce or otherwise change the jury verdict in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Remittur granted by	The court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has granted a request, motion or petition to remit a portion of the damages awarded by the jury to a party to the action. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Removal denied by	According to language explicitly used by the court, this phrase is used upon denial of an application or petition for transfer in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). See also "removed by" below. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Removal granted by	According to language explicitly used by the court, this phrase is used when the court grants an application or petition for transfer in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). See also "removed by" below. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Removed by	Following the language explicitly used by the court, this phrase is used when the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is transferred across jurisdictions for further proceedings, e.g. from a state court to the U.S. Bankruptcy Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Renumbered to	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of	Caution - Possible negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	administrative action, renumbers the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Reopening denied by	The court has denied the motion of a party to reopen a prior judgment or proceeding in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reopening granted by	The court has granted the motion of a party to reopen a prior judgment or proceeding in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). A full dispositional opinion will be forthcoming. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Reopening granted by	The motion of a party to reopen a prior judgment or proceeding has been granted. Subsequently, the review proceedings have been discontinued or there has been an affirmance or adherence to the earlier judgment in its entirety. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Repealed and Re-enacted by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through repeal and reenactment. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Repealed and renumbered by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through repeal and renumbering. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Repealed and superseded by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, repeals and supersedes the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Repealed by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, repeals or abrogates the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Repealed in part by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, repeals or abrogates in part the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Repealed, re-enacted and renumbered to	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, alters the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) through repeal, reenactment and renumbering. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Replaced by	The citing decision or order replaces the decision or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Reported at	This phrase is used to signify that the same opinion has been reissued and republished with a different citation and date. The phrase is also used when connecting a table case to the reported-in-full version of the same case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reported in full at	This phrase is used to indicate that a decision previously published in table case format (usually the official citation) can also be found in the unofficial, full-text version at cite indicated. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reprint for tracking pending review by	The citing reference is the original opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), reprinted for tracking purposes pending review and is thus not citable. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Reprint for tracking, questionable precedent at	The citing reference is the original opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), reprinted for tracking purposes pending review, and is thus not citable. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reprinted as amended at	This phrase is generally encountered in the Federal Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit, where a prior published opinion by that court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	subsequently republished in full, with some enhancement, modification or amendment incorporated therein. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	
Reprinted as modified at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) by the California Court of Appeals has been subsequently republished with some modification or amendment incorporated therein. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Reprinted as modified for tracking pending review by	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reprinted to permit tracking of the cause following the California Supreme Court's grant of review. See California Rules of Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Reprinted for tracking pending review by	An opinion has been reprinted to permit tracking of the cause following the California Supreme Court's grant of review of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). See California Rules of Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Request denied by	A party to an action has asked the court that it take or not take some particular action, to which the court responds in the negative. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Request granted	A party to an action has asked the court that it take or not take a particular action, to which the court responds in the affirmative. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Rescinded by	The IRS has reduced the precedential value of the ruling you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) in light of its later position. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Rescinded in part by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, revokes or rescinds in part the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Reserved by	A ruling on a particular matter has been put off pending the outcome of a subsequent ruling or case. Subsequently, the particular ruling has	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	been made. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Reserved by	The ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been put off pending the outcome of a subsequent ruling or case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Resettled by	The manner in which the interpretation of the law has been settled in the ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been changed on remand. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Resettlement denied	A court has rejected a request to change the manner in which the interpretation of the law was settled in the ruling in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Retroactivity by	The citing opinion discusses retroactive or prospective application of the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Retroactivity by in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	In a concurring opinion, the current version of the cited statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is applied to a case or cases arising prior to the enactment of the legislation, and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Retroactivity by questionable precedent at	The citing opinion, which has been ordered depublished, discusses retroactive or prospective application of the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Retroactivity in concurring opinion at	The concurring opinion discusses the retroactive or prospective application of the statute, rule, or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reversal noted in	The citing case notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been	Warning - Negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	reversed by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	treatment is indicated (Red)
Reversal noted in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing concurring opinion notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reversed by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reversal noted in concurring opinion	The citing concurring opinion notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reversed by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reversal noted in questionable precedent at	The citing case notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reversed by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reversed by	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case reverses the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Reversed by Court of Appeal at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reversed by the appropriate Ohio Court of Appeals. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases which are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Reversed by Court of Common Pleas at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reversed by the Ohio Court of Common Pleas. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases which are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Reversed by Supreme Court at	The decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reversed by the Ohio Supreme Court. This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases which are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Reversed by questionable precedent at	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case reverses the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reversed without opinion at	An appellate court has overturned the lower court's judgment, decree or order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but without an opinion discussing its reasons for the reversal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Review denied and ordered not published by	An appellate court has denied a petition for review of a lower court decision and the court has ordered that the corresponding opinion is not to be published in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Review denied by	Review of the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been denied by the appropriate appellate department. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Review denied by questionable precedent at	An appellate court has refused to accept or hear an appeal of the judgment, decree, or order of the lower court or administrative agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review dismissed by	An appellate court has discontinued an appeal without consideration of the judgment, decree, or order of the lower court or administrative agency. The language "review dismissed" is used by the court. For Florida cases, an appellate court has refused, without consideration, a request to review an earlier lower court decision. The language "review dismissed" is used by the Florida court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review dismissed by questionable precedent at	An appellate court has reconsidered and retracted its own prior order granting appeal in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) or has discontinued an appeal without consideration of the judgment, decree, or order of the lower	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	court or administrative agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Review granted by	A court acting in an appellate capacity has approved the review of an earlier decision issued by a lower court or administrative agency. Subsequently, review has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review granted by	Review of the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been approved in the appropriate appellate department. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Review granted by questionable precedent at	An appellate court has agreed to accept or hear an appeal in order to review the judgment, decree, or order of the lower court or administrative agency in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court.	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Review granted without petition by	A citing order grants, on the court's own motion, a petition for discretionary review of the cited case. Subsequently, review has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review granted without petition by	At least four judges of the Texas Court of Criminal Appeals have voted to grant discretionary review without petition in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Review granted, Depublished by	The citing reference grants review of and depublishes the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to California Rules of Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Review granted, depublished, and transferred by	Review of the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been approved by the California Supreme Court thereby automatically depublishing the opinion pursuant to California Rules of Court. In the same opinion, the California Supreme Court transfers the	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	action back to that court for further proceedings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	
Review granted, opinion to remain citable by	A petition for review has been granted in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), and the lower court opinion remains published and citable. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review granted, transferred by	In the same opinion, a higher court has granted a review of the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and transfers the action back to that court for further proceedings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Review improvidently allowed by	An appellate court after having granted review of a lower court case, decides after a thorough review of the case that review should not have previously been granted on some or all of the issues in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review or Rehearing denied by	The citing case denies review or rehearing of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review or Rehearing granted by	The citing reference grants review or certiorari in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Review or Rehearing granted, Depublished by	The citing reference grants review of and depublishes the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) pursuant to California Rules of Court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Review overruled by	An appellate court has rejected a request to examine the lower court's decision in the case you SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review pending at	An appellate court is postponing its decision on whether to review the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), generally because it is waiting for a decision in another case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Review pending at	A court acting in an appellate capacity has postponed a decision on whether to review a decision issued by a lower court or an administrative agency. Subsequently, review has been discontinued or denied. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review quashed by	A higher court, after having previously decided to review the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), has decided to discontinue its appellate review without rendering a decision on the merits of the lower court case, generally on the ground that review was improvidently granted. The language "review quashed" is specifically used. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review refused by	A higher court is rejecting a request for review of the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM); the language "review refused" is specifically used. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review reinstated by	A petition for review, which had previously been denied or dismissed, has been reinstated. Subsequently, review has been discontinued or there has been an affirmance. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Review reinstated by	A petition for review that had previously been denied or dismissed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been reinstated. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Review sustained by	An appellate court has agreed to examine the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Review withdrawn by	A review that was pending before the court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has ended upon request by the appellant. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Reviewed by	This phrase signifies that a higher court has examined the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM); a disposition is pending. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Revised and renumbered by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action revises and renumbers the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Revised by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, revises or modifies the statute, regulation or order that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Revoked and replaced by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action revokes and replaces the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Revoked by	For administrative actions, the citing reference, typically a record of administrative action, revokes or rescinds the regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). For case law, a court has annulled or vacated its decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and the language "revoked" is specifically used. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Revoked in part by	The citing reference, typically a record of administrative action, revokes or rescinds in part the regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Revoked or Rescinded by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, revokes or rescinds the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Same case at	The citing case involves the same litigation as the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but at a different stage of the proceedings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Same case by questionable precedent at	The citing case involves the same litigation as the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but at a different stage of the proceedings. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Same judgment in appeal on question of law and fact by	An appellate court has rendered the same judgment in appeal on question of law and fact as was rendered in the court of first instance in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase is used only with older Ohio cases which are cited without reference. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Sanctions allowed by	A court has determined that sanctions should be allowed or granted. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Sanctions disallowed by	A court has determined that sanctions should be disallowed or denied. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Sentence imposed by	The case that you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has issued and/or discussed the imposition of a criminal sentence. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Set aside by	A higher court is reversing or vacating the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), specifically using the language "set aside." SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Set aside in part and remanded in part by	A higher court has annulled or vacated part of the lower court decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and has remanded the remainder of the case for further proceedings; The language of "set aside" is specifically used. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Settled by	This phrase indicates that a proceeding has been finalized by the agreement of the parties, and that no further action in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is expected. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Special Order at	The citing reference is an order of the court (other than grants and denials of leave to appeal from the Court of Appeals) of general interest of the bench and bar of the state. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Special Order at	An order has been issued by a Michigan appellate court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) that is of general interest to the bench and bar of the state. This phrase is used exclusively in the Michigan appellate courts. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Special Panel Convened at	A special panel of Michigan Court of Appeals judges has convened to resolve a conflict between the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) and one of more other Court of Appeals decisions. This phrase is used exclusively by the Michigan appellate courts.	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Special Panel Convened at	A special panel of Court of Appeals judges has convened to resolve a conflict between the citing reference and one or more other Court of Appeals decisions. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Stay denied by	A motion to suspend an order, action or proceeding has been denied by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Stay dissolved by	An order to stay an order, action or proceeding has been lifted or dissolved. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Stay granted by	A motion to suspend the action or proceeding in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been granted by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Stay lifted by	The court has revoked the temporary suspension of the prior order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Stay vacated by	A stay which has been previously granted in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been vacated by the court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Sub nomine at	A Latin phrase which means "under the name". This phrase is used in combination with another case history phrase when the title of a subsequent appellate history case is substantially different from the title of the prior case. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Submitted on	This phrase is used to note that the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been presented to a court for determination; this phrase is generally used with a date reference rather than a citation. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Subsequent Letter Ruling	The citing letter ruling is a subsequent letter ruling issued in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Subsequent appeal at	A matter is before an appellate court once more, following an initial appeal. The issue may concern a post-trial motion or, if the earlier appeal dealt with a pre-trial or interlocutory matter, the decision on the merits. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Subsequent civil proceeding at	A phrase used to connect cases when a subsequent civil proceeding (e.g. a civil rights action) ensues after a prior criminal action. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Subsequent opinion on rehearing at	This phrase specifically tracks language used in California court decisions with reference to the rehearing of the prior decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) of the same court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Subsequent opinion on rehearing not for publication	The California Court of Appeals issued a published opinion and thereafter granted rehearing; the subsequent opinion on rehearing was designated not for publication in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Substituted opinion at	A court opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) which has been withdrawn has been supplanted with a new opinion. This phrase is used to track specific court language. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Suggestion of error overruled by	This phrase is specifically tracks language used in Mississippi court decisions with reference to requests for rehearing of the decision of the same court in the case you are	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Suggestion of error sustained by	SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue) This phrase specifically tracks language used in Mississippi court decisions with reference to requests for rehearing of the decision of the same court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Suggestion of error sustained in part and overruled in part by	This phrase specifically tracks language used in Mississippi court decisions with reference to requests for rehearing of the decision of the same court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Summary judgment denied by	A party to the civil case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), believing there is no genuine issue of material fact, moves the court to rule in their favor as a matter of law; the court has denied the motion due to the presence of a disputed fact. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Summary judgment dismissed by	A party to the civil case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved for the court to rule in their favor as a matter of law, due to an absence of a genuine issue of material fact; the court has dismissed said motion. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Summary judgment granted by	A court has ruled as matter of law in favor of one party to the civil case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), due to the absence of a genuine issue of material fact. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Summary judgment granted, in part, summary judgment denied, in part by	A party to the civil case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), believing there is no genuine issue of material fact, moves the court to rule in their favor as a matter of law; the court has ruled, in part, as matter of law in favor of one party to the civil case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), due to the absence of a genuine issue of material fact. The court has also denied the motion in part due to the presence of a disputed fact. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Summary judgment proceeding at	This phrase is generally used when multiple motions for summary judgment are heard and resolved in a single opinion. In essence, a party to the civil case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) requests the judge to rule as a matter of law due to an absence of a genuine issue of fact. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Summary opinion at	A brief synopsis of the opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) appears at the citation indicated. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Superseded and renumbered by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, supersedes and renumbers the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Superseded by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, supersedes the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Superseded by	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case supersedes or is substituted for the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). In California, the Supreme Court has reviewed the decision of the appellate court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Superseded by	The precedential weight of the ruling you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been supplanted by a subsequent ruling. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Superseded by questionable precedent at	On appeal, reconsideration or rehearing, the citing case supersedes or is substituted for the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Superseded by statute as stated in	The opinion of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been affected adversely by a subsequent legislative enactment (e.g. a new, amended or repealed statute),	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Superseded by statute as stated in questionable precedent at	constitutional amendment, or court rule, as stated in the opinion of the later case, thereby casting doubt on the continuing validity or precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Superseded by statute in Concurring Opinion	The concurring opinion questions the continuing validity or precedential value of the cited case because of a subsequent change in a statute, constitution, court rule, or regulation. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Superseded by statute in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	In a concurring opinion, the citing opinion questions the continuing validity or precedential value of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because of a subsequent change to a statute, constitution, court rule, or regulation, and the citing case has been ordered depublished by a California appellate court. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Superseded in part by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, supersedes in part the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Supplemental opinion at	The court has disposed of some issue left unresolved in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). Dispositions in the supplemental opinion have no effect on issues previously determined. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Supplemented by	For statutes, regulations or administrative orders, the citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action or a	Caution - Possible negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	record of administrative action, supplements the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). For case law, a court has added information to the opinion in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), often disposing of an issue left unresolved by the earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	treatment (Yellow)
Supplementing	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, supplements the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Suspended and superseded by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, suspends and supersedes the statute you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Suspended by	Suspended is used in rare situations to show that the previous published rulings will not be applied pending some future action.	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Suspended by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, suspends the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Suspended by	The operation of the ruling you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been interrupted. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Suspended in part by	The citing reference, typically a session law or other record of legislative action, or a record of administrative action, suspends in part the statute, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Tax value determined	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), the Tax Board or Commission has assessed the property value for tax purposes.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Time for granting or denying hearing extended by	The California Supreme Court has extended the time during which a party may file a petition for	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	hearing in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) under the California Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Time for granting or denying rehearing extended by	The California Supreme Court has extended the time in which it must deny a rehearing in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) under the California Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Time for granting or denying review extended by	The California Supreme Court has extended the time in which it must grant or deny review of the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Transfer denied by	A court has refused a request to accept jurisdiction over the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase is used often between state and federal courts, as well as within the court systems of Indiana and California. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Transfer denied by Supreme Court as reported in	A court notes that an earlier, unrelated decision by the California Court of Appeals has become final, with the California Supreme Court refusing to transfer the action to its court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Transfer dismissed by	A court, after having previously agreed to accept transfer of an action from another court, now retracts its offer and refuses to accept jurisdiction. This phrase is used often between state and federal courts, as well as within the court systems of Indiana and California. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Transfer granted by	A court has granted a request to accept jurisdiction over the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). This phrase is used often between state and federal courts, as well as within the court systems of Indiana and California. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Transfer granted by	A citing reference has granted a request to accept jurisdiction over a case. Subsequently,	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	transfer proceedings have been discontinued or there has been an affirmance in the entirety. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Transferred by	The Missouri Supreme Court has ordered a cause transferred from the Missouri Court of Appeals, but later has discontinued those transfer proceedings. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Transferred by	The citing case transfers the pending action or case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to another appellate court or a lower court for further review and disposition. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution-Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Transferred to	This phrase notes that the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been transferred from one court to another. In California, the phrase notes that the case has been transferred from the California Supreme Court to a Court of Appeal, from a Court of Appeal to the California Supreme Court, or between divisions of the Court of Appeal by order of the California Supreme Court under Rule 20 of the California Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
U.S. certified question filed by	A question of law in the case has been certified to the Supreme Court of Texas by the Supreme Court of the United States or a United States Court of Appeals under Rule 114. Subsequently, that certified question has been answered. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
U.S. certified question filed by	This phrase is used in Texas. A question of law in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been certified to the Supreme Court of Texas by the Supreme Court of the United States or a United States Court of Appeals under Rule 114. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
US Supreme Court appeal pending at	Appeal or certiorari is pending before the U.S. Supreme Court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
US Supreme Court certiorari denied by	The citing order by the U.S. Supreme Court denies certiorari in the case you are	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
US Supreme Court certiorari dismissed by	The citing order by the U.S. Supreme Court dismisses certiorari in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
US Supreme Court certiorari granted by	The citing order by the U.S. Supreme Court grants certiorari in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
US Supreme Court rehearing denied by	The citing order by the U.S. Supreme Court denies rehearing in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
US Supreme Court rehearing dismissed by	The citing order by the U.S. Supreme Court dismisses rehearing in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Unconstitutional by	The citing case declares unconstitutional the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Unconstitutional by questionable precedent at	The citing case, which has been ordered depublished, declares unconstitutional the statute, rule or regulation your SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Unconstitutional in part by	The citing case declares unconstitutional in part the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Unconstitutional in part by questionable precedent at	The citing case, which has been ordered depublished, declares unconstitutional in part the statute, rule or regulation you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Vacated by	The citing case vacates or withdraws the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Vacated by questionable precedent at	The citing case vacates or withdraws the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Vacated without op. by	An appellate court has annulled or set aside the lower court's judgment, decree or order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), but without any written opinion discussing its reason for vacating the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Vacatur noted in	The citing case notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been vacated by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Vacatur noted in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing concurring opinion notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been vacated by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Vacatur noted in concurring opinion	The citing concurring opinion notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been vacated by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Vacatur noted in questionable precedent at	The citing case notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been vacated by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Valid by	The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is valid. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Valid by	The citing case upholds the validity of the statute, rule, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Valid in part by	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are valid.	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	
Valid, Infringed by	The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is valid and infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Valid, Infringed in part by	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are valid and infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Valid, Not infringed by	The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is valid and not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Valid, Not infringed in part by	The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are valid and not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Positive treatment is indicated (Green)	Positive treatment is indicated (Green)
Valid, infringed, and limited by	The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is valid, infringed and limited. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Valid, limited by	The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is valid and limited. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Valid/Depublished	The citing case, which has been ordered depublished, upholds the validity of the statute, rule, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Validity questioned by	The continuing validity or soundness of the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is questioned because of intervening circumstances, including a change in judicial law, the passage of time or reversal, vacatur or withdrawal by another decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Questioned: Validity questioned by citing refs (Orange)	Questioned - Validity questioned by citing references (Orange)
Value stipulated	In the decision you are SHEPARDIZING (TM), the Tax Board or Commission has approved the property value stipulated to by the parties.	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Void or invalid by	The citing case declares void or invalid the statute, rule, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because it conflicts with an	Warning - Negative

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Void or invalid by questionable precedent at	<p>authority that takes priority. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p> <p>The citing case, which has been ordered depublished, declares void or invalid the statute, rule, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because it conflicts with an authority that takes priority. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	<p>treatment is indicated (Red)</p> <p>Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>
Void or invalid in part by	<p>The citing case declares void or invalid part of the statute, rule, regulation or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) because it conflicts with an authority that takes priority. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	<p>Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>
Void or invalid patent, Infringed in part by	<p>The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are void, invalid or unenforceable and/or infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	<p>Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>
Void or invalid patent, Not infringed by	<p>The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is void, invalid or unenforceable and/or not infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	<p>Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>
Void or invalid, Infringed by	<p>The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is void, invalid or unenforceable and/or infringed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	<p>Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>
Void patent by	<p>The citing case holds that the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is void, invalid or unenforceable. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	<p>Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>
Void patent in part by	<p>The citing case holds that certain claims of the patent you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) are void, invalid or unenforceable. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	<p>Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>
Withdrawal noted in	<p>The citing case notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn by an earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>	<p>Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)</p>

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Withdrawal noted in Depublished Concurring Opinion at	The citing concurring opinion notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Withdrawal noted in concurring opinion	The citing concurring opinion notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn by and earlier decision. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Withdrawal noted in questionable precedent at	The citing case notes that all or part of the decision you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been withdrawn by an earlier decision. The citing case itself may be questionable due to a later action that affects its precedential value. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Withdrawn by	The citing decision or order withdraws the decision or order you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Withdrawn by publisher	The publisher of the case reporter has removed the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) from its publication, sometimes to move it to a new location. SHEPARD'S Signal: Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)	Warning - Negative treatment is indicated (Red)
Without opinion by	This phrase is used in combination with another history phrase to note that there is only a court's disposition at that citation, rather than a full opinion; e.g., "affirmed without opinion." SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Without prejudice by	A request, motion, petition, or similar matter, in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), has been denied or dismissed; however the court has stated that the party making the request, motion, petition, or similar matter has the option of reasserting the issues or legal arguments raised therein at a future date. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ denied by	The citing case denies an application for a writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM).	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ dismissed by	The citing case dismisses an application for a writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ granted by	An application for a writ has been granted. Subsequently, the writ proceeding has been discontinued or no error has been found upon review. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ granted by	The citing case grants an application for a writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow).	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ granted without reference to merits	The citing order grants, without reference to the merits, application for writ of error and remands the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) for rendition of judgment according to a settlement agreement of the parties. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of Habeas corpus denied with written order	The citing order denies, with written opinion, application for writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of certiorari denied	The citing order denies writ of certiorari in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of certiorari denied and appeal dismissed	A higher court, having before it both a motion for a writ of certiorari and an appeal from the lower court's decision in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), has decided to refuse the writ of certiorari and has dismissed the appeal from the lower court. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of certiorari dismissed	A higher court, after having exercised its discretion to accept or hear an appeal from the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), by granting a writ of certiorari requiring the lower court to produce a certified record of the case decided therein, has discontinued its appellate review, usually on the ground that it was improvidently granted, without rendering a decision on the merits of	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Writ of certiorari granted	<p>the case. The lower court result is still good law, although further appeal may be possible.</p> <p>A higher court has exercised its discretion to accept or hear an appeal from the lower court by agreeing to issue a writ of certiorari, a common law process requiring the lower court to produce a certified record of the case decided therein for purposes of appellate review. Subsequently, the writ of certiorari has been discontinued or the higher court has affirmed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of certiorari granted	<p>A higher court has exercised its discretion to accept or hear an appeal from the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), by agreeing to issue a writ of certiorari, a common law process requiring the lower court to produce a certified record of the case decided therein for purposes of appellate review. There will likely be a subsequent order or opinion by the higher court to indicate its disposition of the appeal. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of certiorari granted in part and denied in part	<p>A higher court has decided to issue a writ of certiorari to the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) on some issues, while declining to issue the writ for other issues. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)</p>	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of certiorari granted in part and denied in part	<p>A higher court has decided to issue a writ of certiorari to the lower court on some issues, while declining to issue the writ for other issues. Subsequently, the writ of certiorari has been discontinued or the higher court has affirmed. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of certiorari quashed	<p>A higher court, after having previously decided to issue a writ of certiorari to the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), has decided to discontinue its appellate review without rendering a decision on the merits of the lower court case, usually on the ground that certiorari was improvidently granted. The language "certiorari quashed" is specifically</p>	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	used. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	
Writ of certiorari vacated	A higher court, after having previously granted an appeal from the lower court in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), discontinues its appellate review without rendering an decision on the merits of the case, usually on the ground that the appeal was improvidently granted. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error denied	The citing order denies application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is not satisfied that the opinion of the Court of Appeals is correct in all respects but opines that the application presents no error of law that requires reversal or is of such importance as to require correction. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed	This phrase is used mainly in Texas. Appellant has failed to comply with the Rules of Appellate Procedure, or with any order of the Court. Writ is dismissed on Court's own motion under Rule 60 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed by agreement	The citing order dismisses, by agreement of the parties, application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed by agreement	This phrase is used mainly in Texas. Writ of error is disposed of by filed agreement of the parties, or on appellant's motion to dismiss the appeal under Rule 59 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed for want of bond	The citing order dismisses, for want of bond, the writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed for want of jurisdiction	The citing order dismisses, for want of jurisdiction, application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Writ of error dismissed for want of prosecution	The citing order dismisses, for want of prosecution, the writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed on motion by applicant	The citing order dismisses, on motion of the applicant, the writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed or refused	The citing order dismisses or refuses writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error dismissed, judgment correct	The citing order dismisses application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), upholding the judgment as correct. In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is not satisfied that the opinion of the Court of Appeals is correct in all respects but opines that the application presents no error of law that requires reversal or is of such importance as to require correction. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error filed	This phrase is used in Texas. A party wishing to appeal a final judgment in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to the Court of Appeals has filed a petition to sue out a writ of error with the Clerk of the Court of Appeals under Rule 132 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of error granted	Application for writ of error has been granted. Subsequently, the writ of error has been discontinued or no error has been found upon review. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error granted	The citing order grants application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of error not considered	This phrase is used in Texas. A writ of error filed pursuant to Rule 132 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure has been ordered redrawn, or has been annulled by the court sua sponte or on motion of a party. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Writ of error refused	The citing order refuses application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is satisfied that the judgment of the Court of Appeals is correct. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error refused for want of merit	The citing order refuses, for want of merit, application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is not satisfied that the opinion of the Court of Appeals is correct in all respects but opines that the application presents no error of law that requires reversal or is of such importance as to require correction. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error refused no reversible error	The citing order refuses application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), finding no reversible error. In Texas Supreme Court cases, the Supreme Court is not satisfied that the opinion of the Court of Appeals is correct in all respects but opines that the application presents no error of law that requires reversal or is of such importance as to require correction. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of error transferred	A court has deferred its decision on the merit of the writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) to another court. This phrase is used with older Texas cases. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of habeas corpus denied	The court has refused to issue a writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of habeas corpus denied without written order	The citing order denies, without written opinion, application for writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of habeas corpus dismissed	The citing order dismisses application for writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of habeas corpus filed	A petition seeking the issuance of a writ of habeas corpus in the case you are	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARDIZING(TM) has been presented to Clerk of the Court of Appeals, with the appropriate deposit of costs under Rule 120 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of habeas corpus granted	The citing order grants application for writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of habeas corpus requested	The citing reference notes an application for writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of habeas corpus returned no action	The citing order returns, marked no action, application for writ of habeas corpus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus and cause of relator filed	A petition for a writ of mandamus, together with the cause of the relator has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) under Rule 121 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus and writ of prohibition filed	A petition for a writ of mandamus and a writ of prohibition has been filed in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) under Rule 121 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus and writ of prohibition overruled	The Texas Supreme Court has overruled a motion for leave to file a petition for a writ of mandamus and writ of prohibition in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) under Rule 121 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus awarded	The citing order awards writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of mandamus denied	A party to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved a higher court to command a lower court to perform some act; the higher court has denied the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
Writ of mandamus denied	The citing order denies application for writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus filed	A proceeding for a writ of mandamus has been commenced in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of mandamus filed	An application for a writ of mandamus has been filed. Subsequently, it has been denied or discontinued. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus granted	A party to the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) has moved a higher court to command a lower court to perform some act; the higher court has granted the request. SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of mandamus granted	The citing order grants application for writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of mandamus granted in part	The citing order grants in part application for writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of mandamus issued	The citing order declares that writ of mandamus will issue in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of mandamus overruled	The citing order overrules motion for writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus overruled	The Texas Supreme Court has overruled a motion for leave to file a petition for a writ of mandamus under Rule 121 of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus refused	The citing order refuses application for writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus refused in part	The citing order refuses in part application for writ of mandamus in the case you are	Neutral treatment is

Shepard's Editorial Phrase	Description	Shepard's Signal Indicator
	SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of mandamus requested	The citing reference notes application for writ of mandamus in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ of rehearing denied	The citing order denies rehearing of an application for writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ of rehearing granted	The citing order grants rehearing of an application for writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writ quashed	A request for appellate review of the order in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM) is annulled by the court, and the phrase "writ quashed" is specifically used. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ refused by	The citing case refuses an application for a writ in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)
Writ requested	The citing reference notes an application for writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM). SHEPARD'S Signal: Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)	Caution - Possible negative treatment (Yellow)
Writs of error as amended overruled	This phrase is used in Texas. An application for a writ of error in the case you are SHEPARDIZING(TM), amended in accordance with Rule 131(f) of the Texas Rules of Appellate Procedure, has nonetheless been overruled. SHEPARD'S Signal: Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)	Neutral treatment is indicated. (Dark Blue)